## Mass Inflation without Cauchy Horizons

Raúl Carballo-Rubio<sup>®</sup>

[CP3-Origins](https://ror.org/04y51qn38), University of Southern Denmark, Campusvej 55, DK-5230 Odense M, Denmark

Francesco Di Filippo

Institute of Theoretical Physics, Faculty of Mathematics and Physics, [Charles University](https://ror.org/024d6js02), V Holešovičkách 2, 180 00 Prague 8, Czech Republic

Stefano Liberati<sup>o</sup>

SISSA—[International School for Advanced Studies,](https://ror.org/004fze387) Via Bonomea 265, 34136 Trieste, Italy; IFPU—[Institute for Fundamental Physics of the Universe](https://ror.org/0409c3r50), Via Beirut 2, 34014 Trieste, Italy and [INFN Sezione di Trieste,](https://ror.org/05j3snm48) Via Valerio 2, 34127 Trieste, Italy

Matt Visser<sup>®</sup>

School of Mathematics and Statistics, [Victoria University of Wellington](https://ror.org/0040r6f76), P.O. Box 600, Wellington 6140, New Zealand

(Received 12 March 2024; revised 12 September 2024; accepted 23 September 2024; published 1 November 2024)

Mass inflation is a well established instability, conventionally associated to Cauchy horizons (which are also inner trapping horizons) of stationary geometries, leading to a divergent exponential buildup of energy. We show here that finite (but often large) exponential buildups of energy are present for dynamical geometries describing accreting black holes with slowly evolving inner trapping horizons, even in the absence of Cauchy horizons. The explicit evaluation of the adiabatic conditions behind these exponential buildups shows that this phenomenon is universally present for physically reasonable accreting conditions. This noneternal mass inflation does not require the introduction of global spacetime concepts. We also show that various known results in the literature are recovered in the limit in which the inner trapping horizon asymptotically approaches a Cauchy horizon. Our results imply that black hole geometries with nonextremal inner horizons, including the Kerr geometry in general relativity, and nonextremal regular black holes in theories beyond general relativity, can describe dynamical transients but not the long-lived end point of gravitational collapse.

DOI: [10.1103/PhysRevLett.133.181402](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.133.181402)

Introduction—The mass inflation instability is an integral part of our understanding of general relativity, playing a crucial role in destabilizing the Cauchy horizons associated with timelike singularities [\[1](#page-4-0)–[3\]](#page-4-1), as well as destabilizing the chronological horizons (a subclass of Cauchy horizons [\[4](#page-5-0)]) delimiting regions with closed timelike curves. The presence of such an exponential buildup of energy is considered a prerequisite to save causality in some general relativity solutions (such as the Kerr black hole), by making singular the boundary of the region violating causality and so, de facto, by excising the latter from the physical spacetime [\[5](#page-5-1)–[8\]](#page-5-2). Hence, mass inflation plays a crucial role in the enforcement of both strong cosmic censorship [[9](#page-5-3)[,10\]](#page-5-4) and chronology protection. So any possibility of evading mass inflation should be considered with deep suspicion.

Mass inflation is conventionally defined as an infinite divergent exponential buildup of energy [\[5](#page-5-1)–[8\]](#page-5-2). The divergent behavior has been so far associated to stationary geometries, for which inner trapping horizons are always also Cauchy horizons. In all these cases, it is worth noticing that the (finite) exponential buildup of energy and curvature invariants generally leads to a breakdown of the effective description based on general relativity before any divergence is reached. Indeed, a more physical definition of mass inflation should rely only on the existence of a transient but large exponential buildup—until high enough curvatures (e.g., Planckian) are reached—regardless of the presence of any mathematical divergence. This is the novel perspective we adopt in this Letter.

This shift in perspective is motivated by recent results regarding mass inflation in regular black holes, in which a taming of the inner singularity is postulated on the basis of the idea that quantum gravity (regardless of the specific implementation) should provide a regular description of gravitational collapse [[11](#page-5-5)–[25\]](#page-5-6)(see also the reviews[\[26](#page-5-7)–[28](#page-5-8)]). It is by now well established that stationary regular black holes with inner horizons also display an initial exponential mass inflation phase [\[29](#page-5-9)–[33](#page-5-10)]—at least unless the inner horizon is extremal [\[34](#page-5-11)[,35](#page-5-12)]—that very rapidly brings the regular black hole into a regime where curvatures grow large (see also [\[36](#page-5-13)–[40\]](#page-5-14)).

In this Letter we show that (large but finite) exponential buildups of energy are also associated with slowly evolving inner horizons, with the results valid for Cauchy horizons recovered in the stationary limit. This provides a more physical realization of mass inflation implying that even noneternal black hole spacetimes endowed with a slowly evolving dynamical inner horizon will generically display a large but finite exponential buildup destabilizing the geometry in short timescales, which we call noneternal mass inflation.

Working with two different models of perturbations with pure radiation (also know as null dust [[41](#page-5-15)]) sources, either of distributional or continuous nature, we will show that both models display noneternal mass inflation. The first model can be solved analytically, while we shall present numerical results for the second.

Adiabatic conditions—The ingredients necessary for mass inflation (namely, inner trapping horizons that are perturbed) can be defined also in the presence of rotation, and there is no indication that the latter can prevent the phenomenon [[42](#page-6-0)–[44](#page-6-1)]. Hence, for simplicity, we shall work in spherical symmetry, expecting that our results apply also for rotating geometries. Existing analytical and numerical studies support this expectation; see for instance [\[45,](#page-6-2)[46\]](#page-6-3) and [\[47](#page-6-4)[,48\]](#page-6-5) for rotating and charged black holes, respectively. An appropriate general parametrization is provided by generalized Eddington-Finkelstein coordinates in which the line element reads

$$
ds^{2} = -e^{-2\Phi(v,r)}F(v,r)dv^{2} + 2e^{-\Phi(v,r)}dr dv + r^{2}d\Omega^{2}, \quad (1)
$$

where  $d\Omega^2$  is the line element on the unit 2-sphere. It is possible to recast this line element in terms of a non-null time coordinate  $t$ , but this form is best suited for our purposes. The Misner-Sharp mass [\[49](#page-6-6)[,50\]](#page-6-7), used below, is given by  $M(v,r) = r(1-\partial_a r \partial^a r)/2 = r(1-q^{rr})/2$  [\[50,](#page-6-7)[51\]](#page-6-8).

<span id="page-1-2"></span>We consider black holes with both outer and inner horizons in which the  $g_{vv}$  component of the metric vanishes (e.g., Reissner-Nordström or regular black holes). Without significant loss of generality, we can focus on the case with two horizons, the minimum number required by regularity at the origin [\[52\]](#page-6-9):

$$
F(v,r) = e^{\Psi(v,r)} \left( 1 - \frac{r_{\text{in}}(v)}{r} \right) \left( 1 - \frac{r_{\text{out}}(v)}{r} \right). \tag{2}
$$

Our analysis can be straightfowardly generalized to black holes with more than two horizons, such as the ones found in the presence of a cosmological constant [\[53](#page-6-10)[,54\]](#page-6-11).

The two models studied below include an outgoing nulldust thin shell. Outgoing null geodesics satisfy the equation

$$
\frac{dr(v)}{dv} = \frac{e^{-\Phi(v,r)}F(v,r)}{2},
$$
\n(3) 
$$
\left|\frac{dr_{in}(v)}{dv}\right| \ll |\kappa_{in}(v)||
$$

<span id="page-1-0"></span>which can be expanded around the position of the inner horizon,  $r = r_{\text{in}}(v)$ , to first order

$$
\frac{dr(v)}{dv} = \frac{e^{-\Phi(v,r_{\text{in}}(v))}}{2} \left( \frac{\partial F}{\partial r} \bigg|_{(v,r_{\text{in}}(v))} [r(v) - r_{\text{in}}(v)] \right) + \cdots. \tag{4}
$$

We define the time-dependent surface gravity of the inner horizon, controlling the peeling of null rays around the latter, as [[55](#page-6-12)]

$$
\kappa_{\rm in}(v) = \frac{e^{-\Phi(v,r_{\rm in}(v))}}{2} \frac{\partial F}{\partial r}\Big|_{(v,r_{\rm in}(v))} = -|\kappa_{\rm in}(v)|. \tag{5}
$$

This definition reduces to the usual surface gravity of a Killing horizon for stationary geometries [\[55\]](#page-6-12).

Equation [\(4\)](#page-1-0) can be recast as a differential equation for the difference  $r(v) - r_{in}(v)$  as

$$
\frac{d[r(v) - r_{\rm in}(v)]}{dv} = -|\kappa_{\rm in}(v)|[r(v) - r_{\rm in}(v)] - \frac{dr_{\rm in}(v)}{dv} + \cdots
$$
\n(6)

<span id="page-1-3"></span>In the stationary situation,  $r_{\text{in}}$  is constant in time and so is  $|\kappa_{\rm in}|$ , thus simplifying the equation above as terms proportional to derivatives of these quantities vanish identically. In more general situations, the derivative terms are negligible if the following adiabatic conditions are satisfied: (i) Adiabatic condition for radius of the inner horizon:

$$
\left|\frac{dr_{\rm in}(v)}{dv}\right| \ll |\kappa_{\rm in}(v)||r(v) - r_{\rm in}(v)|. \tag{7}
$$

<span id="page-1-4"></span>(ii) Adiabatic condition for surface gravity of the inner horizon:

$$
\left| \frac{d\kappa_{\rm in}(v)}{dv} \right| \ll |\kappa_{\rm in}(v)|^2. \tag{8}
$$

These are conditions on the first and second derivatives of  $r_{\text{in}}(v)$  and thus can be violated or satisfied independently of each other. The first condition requires the specification of an outgoing null geodesic  $r(v)$  for its evaluation. The second condition ensures the slow changing of the inner horizon and is equivalent to the condition for the outer horizon in [[56](#page-6-13),[57](#page-6-14)], replacing the outer surface gravity by the inner surface gravity. Under these two conditions, we can write

<span id="page-1-1"></span>
$$
r(v) \approx r_{\rm in}(v) + [r(v_0) - r_{\rm in}(v_0)]e^{-|\kappa_{\rm in}(v)|(v-v_0)}, \quad (9)
$$

with the initial condition  $r(v_0) \in (r_{\text{in}}(v_0), r_{\text{out}}(v_0)).$ Inserting Eq. [\(9\)](#page-1-1) in the adiabatic condition for the radius of the inner horizon, we obtain

$$
\left|\frac{d r_{\rm in}(v)}{2},\right| \qquad (3) \qquad \left|\frac{d r_{\rm in}(v)}{d v}\right| \ll |\kappa_{\rm in}(v)| [r(v_0) - r_{\rm in}(v_0)] e^{-|\kappa_{\rm in}(v)|(v-v_0)}.\tag{10}
$$

This equation illustrates that, even if the adiabatic condition is always satisfied, the condition for slow variation of the inner horizon will always eventually cease to be valid as long as  $dr_{\text{in}}/dv$  is nonzero. This will happen at some time  $v_{\star}$  that, given the assumed adiabatic evolution of the surface gravity, is approximately given by the explicit formula

<span id="page-2-2"></span>
$$
v_{\star} \approx v_0 + \frac{1}{|\kappa_{\rm in}(v_{\star})|} \ln \left\{ \frac{|\kappa_{\rm in}(v_{\star})| [r(v_0) - r_{\rm in}(v_0)]}{|\mathrm{d}r_{\rm in}/\mathrm{d}v|_{v_{\star}}} \right\}.
$$
 (11)

Note that the adiabatic conditions are defined in relation to the behavior of outgoing null shells around the inner horizon, without any reference to mass inflation. Connecting these conditions to mass inflation requires a separate treatment discussed below.

Analytical results—Aside from the outgoing null-dust thin shell, let us introduce an ingoing null-dust thin shell, which is a standard setup to discuss mass inflation [\[58,](#page-6-15)[59](#page-6-16)]. One of the advantages of this setup is that the change of the metric coefficients due to the crossing of the shells can be determined geometrically, without specifying the field equations of the theory [\[29](#page-5-9)[,37\]](#page-5-16). It is useful to parameterize the metric coefficients in terms of the Misner-Sharp mass  $M_f(v_\times, r_\times)$  in between the ingoing and outgoing null-dust shells after the crossing of the two shells at  $r_x = r(v_x)$ , which is given by [[29](#page-5-9),[31](#page-5-17),[37](#page-5-16)]

<span id="page-2-0"></span>
$$
M_{\rm f}(v_{\times}, r_{\times}) = M_{\rm i}(v_{\times}, r_{\times}) + M_{\rm in}(v_{\times}, r_{\times}) + M_{\rm out}(v_{\times}, r_{\times}) -\frac{2M_{\rm in}(v_{\times}, r_{\times})M_{\rm out}(v_{\times}, r_{\times})}{r_{\times}F_{\rm i}(v_{\times}, r_{\times})},
$$
(12)

where  $M_i(v_\times, r_\times)$  is the mass in between the two shells prior to the crossing at  $r = r_{\times}$  while  $F_i(v_{\times}, r_{\times})$  is the metric function in between the two shells prior to the crossing which, using Eq. [\(2\)](#page-1-2), we can write in terms of  $(v_x, r(v_x))$ as

$$
F_{\rm i}^{\times} = \frac{e^{\Psi(v_{\rm x}, r(v_{\rm x}))}}{r_{\rm in}(v_{\rm x})} \left(1 - \frac{r_{\rm out}(v_{\rm x})}{r_{\rm in}(v_{\rm x})}\right) [r(v_{\rm x}) - r_{\rm in}(v_{\rm x})]. \tag{13}
$$

On the other hand,  $M_{in}(v_{\times}, r_{\times})$  and  $M_{out}(v_{\times}, r_{\times})$  measure the jump of the mass function across the ingoing and the outgoing shell. In the following, we simply assume that these quantities are proportional to the energy of the shells. The crossing time  $v = v_{\times}$  can be chosen so that the quantity  $r(v_x) - r_{in}(v_x)$  can be as small as possible. Hence, the mass  $M_f(v_\times, r_\times)$  in Eq. [\(12\)](#page-2-0) will typically grow large for generic perturbations. The exponential behavior characteristic of stationary situations is present whenever *both* of the aforementioned adiabatic conditions, Eqs. [\(7\)](#page-1-3)–[\(8\)](#page-1-4) are satisfied. However, the first adiabatic condition for the evolution of the inner horizon cannot be maintained indefinitely, in particular because the outgoing shell must eventually cross the inner horizon (see

<span id="page-2-1"></span>

FIG. 1. Penrose diagram describing the formation and disappearance of a black hole with both outer and inner horizons, but not Cauchy horizons, marking the boundary of the (topologically closed, as envisaged by Frolov and others [\[13\]](#page-5-18)) trapped region. The dashed line indicates the placement of an outgoing null-dust thin shell, which approaches the inner horizon exponentially if both adiabatic conditions are satisfied, until a certain critical point marked by the star symbol. The three arrows indicate ingoing perturbations, of which we have considered two different types, either an ingoing null-dust shell or a continuous stream of null dust. These perturbation setups are standard in the study of mass inflation.

<span id="page-2-3"></span>Fig. [1](#page-2-1)). Therefore, the minimum value of the function  $F(v_{\times}, r(v_{\times}))$  that can be guaranteed to be reached exponentially using our argument,  $F_i^* = F_i(v_*, r(v_*)),$ is given by

$$
F_{\rm i}^{\star} = \frac{e^{\Psi(v_{\star}, r_{\rm in}(v_{\star}))}}{r_{\rm in}(v_{\star})} \left(1 - \frac{r_{\rm out}(v_{\star})}{r_{\rm in}(v_{\star})}\right) \frac{|{\rm d}r_{\rm in}/{\rm d}v|_{v_{\star}}}{|\kappa_{\rm in}(v_{\star})|},\qquad(14)
$$

where  $v = v_{\star}$  indicates the time approximately given in Eq. [\(11\).](#page-2-2)

<span id="page-2-4"></span>Using Eqs. [\(12\)](#page-2-0) and [\(14\)](#page-2-3), the mass  $M_f(v_\star, r_\star)$  is guaranteed to display an exponential behavior in  $v_{\times}$ , up to a maximum value

$$
M_{\text{max}} \approx \frac{r_{\text{in}}(v_{\star})|\kappa_{\text{in}}(v_{\star})|}{|dr_{\text{in}}/dv|_{v_{\star}}}\frac{2M_{\text{in}}(v_{\times},r_{\times})M_{\text{out}}(v_{\times},r_{\times})}{r_{\times}}.\tag{15}
$$

Note that this can be factorized into the form  $M_{\text{max}} \simeq f_1(v_\star) f_2(v_\star, r_\star)$ , with one function depending on the end of exponential mass inflation and the other only on the crossing of the null shells.

Equation [\(15\)](#page-2-4) can be understood as the regularized version of  $M_{\text{max}} = \infty$  that is obtained in the static case, where the regulator comes from the exponential approximation ceasing to be valid due to the nonzero value of  $|dr_{in}/dv|_{v_{\star}}$ . As a consistency check, for  $|dr_{\text{in}}/dv|_{v_{\star}} \to 0$  we recover the result  $M_{\text{max}} = \infty$ .

Numerical results—Let us introduce a slightly different perturbation type wherein we maintain an outgoing nulldust shell but replace the ingoing null-dust shell with a continuous stream of null dust. This setup was originally examined by Ori [[60](#page-6-17)] to investigate the instability of Reissner-Nordström black holes and has been applied later to more general situations [[29](#page-5-9)[,32,](#page-5-19)[33\]](#page-5-10). The connection between the adiabatic conditions and mass inflation in this setup is more convoluted and will be demonstrated numerically.

The gluing conditions for two spherically symmetric geometries along a null-dust shell were discussed in [[61](#page-6-18)]. Following the latter reference, we define the future-directed null normal to the shell as  $n^{\mu} = dx^{\mu}/dr = (2e^{\Phi}/F, 1, 0, 0),$ choosing  $r$  as a common parameter for both geometries along the shell. The pressureless nature of the shell implies the continuity of  $T_{\mu\nu}n^{\mu}n^{\nu}$ . This constraint is invariant under reparametrizations of the null normal to the shell.

For concreteness, let us consider the Hayward metric [\[12\]](#page-5-20),

$$
\Phi_{\pm}(v,r) = 0, \quad F_{\pm}(v,r) = 1 - \frac{2r^2 m_{\pm}(v)}{r^3 + 2\ell^2 m_{\pm}(v)}, \quad (16)
$$

where the  $+(-)$  index indicates that the corresponding quantity must be evaluated inside (outside) the outgoing null-dust shell (see Fig. [1\)](#page-2-1). This metric has two horizons, a single extremal horizon or no horizons, depending on the relative value of  $m_{+}(v)$  [\[11\]](#page-5-5) and the regularization scale  $\ell$ . We have checked that our results do not depend on the specific regular black hole considered, by considering alternatives such as the Bardeen metric [\[11\]](#page-5-5). This has to be expected as noneternal mass inflation is determined by the local geometric structure around the inner horizon, regardless of the specific geometry being considered.

<span id="page-3-0"></span>The continuity of  $T_{\mu\nu}n^{\mu}n^{\nu}$  is then equivalent to the following constraint for the Misner-Sharp mass:

$$
\left. \frac{1}{F_+} \frac{\partial F_+}{\partial v} \right|_{r=R(v)} = \left. \frac{1}{F_-} \frac{\partial F_-}{\partial v} \right|_{r=R(v)},\tag{17}
$$

where  $R(v)$  denotes the radius of the outgoing shell.

<span id="page-3-1"></span>The functional form of  $m_-(v)$  is loosely constrained to describe the situation depicted in Fig. [1](#page-2-1), namely a geometry with no horizons at early and late times and an ingoing stream of radiation:

$$
m_{-}(v) = [M_0 + \delta m(v)] I_{v_i, v_f}(v), \qquad (18)
$$

where  $\delta m(v)$  is a nondecreasing function describing a perturbation of the mass due to accretion,  $M_0$  the maximum mass of the background black hole, and  $I_{v_i,v_f}(v) \leq 1$  an interpolating function vanishing for  $v \ll v_i$ and  $v \gg v_f$  and approximately constant for  $v_i \ll v \ll v_f$ . Any interpolating function (possibly of compact support) satisfying these requirements can be considered without changing our results below, and we will be choosing a specific realization using hyperbolic tangents,  $I_{v_i, v_f}(v) = {\tanh [s_1(v - v_i)] - \tanh [s_2(v - v_f)]}/2N$ , with a normalization factor N evaluated numerically.

The mass in the interior region,  $M_{+}(v, R(v))$ , can be obtained integrating Eq. [\(17\)](#page-3-0) numerically. We perform this integration for a finite interval of time contained within the trapped region in which the adiabatic conditions are satisfied, both for the background geometry and the accretion flux. Inserting the relations  $r_{\text{in}} = \ell[1 + \mathcal{O}(\ell/m_{-})]$  and  $\kappa_{\text{in}} = -\ell^{-1}[1 + \mathcal{O}(\ell/m_{-})]$  valid for the Hayward metric  $k_{\text{in}} = -\ell^{-1}[1 + \mathcal{O}(\ell/m_-)],$  valid for the Hayward metric<br>(as well as most known metrics [311), as well as Eq. (18), into (as well as most known metrics [\[31\]](#page-5-17)), as well as Eq.  $(18)$ , into the second adiabatic condition, we obtain

<span id="page-3-2"></span>
$$
\left|\frac{dm_{-}}{dv}\right| \ll \frac{m_{-}^{2}}{\ell^{2}}[1+\mathcal{O}(\ell/m_{-})].\tag{19}
$$

This imposes constraints on the evolution of both background geometry and accretion flux. In the absence of accretion, the leading order in Eq. [\(19\)](#page-3-2) around the maximum of  $I_{v_i,v_f}$  is

$$
\left| \frac{\mathrm{d}I_{v_i, v_f}}{\mathrm{d}v} \right| \ll \frac{M_0}{\ell^2}.
$$
 (20)

The parameters  $v_i \ll v_f$  can always be chosen so that this condition is satisfied for an arbitrarily long time interval. In such an interval, we introduce perturbations with shorter time variations, so that the leading order in Eq. [\(19\)](#page-3-2) becomes

$$
\left|\frac{\mathrm{d}\delta m}{\mathrm{d}v}\right| \ll \frac{M_0^2}{\ell^2}.\tag{21}
$$

The left-hand side contains information about the amplitude  $A_{\delta m}$  of the perturbation and its variation timescale  $\tau_{\delta m}$ . As  $A_{\delta m} \ll M_0$  by construction, the condition  $\tau_{\delta m} \gtrsim \ell^2/M_0$  is sufficient [note that  $\ell/M_0 = \mathcal{O}(10^{-38})$  for a solar-mass black hole with Planckian regulator, but this constraint is still weak even when  $\ell/M_0 = \mathcal{O}(1)$ . We thus conclude that noneternal mass inflation is generically present for fluctuating accretion conditions as long as the mild adiabatic conditions are satisfied, under which the results of the stationary case are recovered.

The above argument accommodates specific decaying profiles such as the Price law [\[62](#page-6-19)–[64](#page-6-20)], ubiquitously used in previous works [\[29](#page-5-9)[,32](#page-5-19)[,33,](#page-5-10)[36](#page-5-13)–[39\]](#page-5-21) but is much more general as it does not require a specific functional profile for  $\delta m(v)$ . To simplify comparison with previous works, while also illustrating the broader generality of our results, we show in

<span id="page-4-2"></span>

FIG. 2. Left: specific realization of Fig. [1](#page-2-1) for the Misner-Sharp mass in Eq. [\(18\)](#page-3-1) and parameters  $M_0 = 10$ ,  $\ell = 1$ ,  $v_i = -20$ ,  $v_f = 1000$ ,  $s_1 = 1$ ,  $s_2 = 1/40$ . The radius of the outgoing shell is set initially at  $R(v = 30) = 5$ . Outer and inner horizons are indicated by the dotted blue line and the dashed red line, respectively, and the outgoing null-dust shell by the black solid line. The shaded region marks the interval of time for which  $M_+(v, R(v))$  is plotted in the right-hand panel. Right: Misner-Sharp mass  $M_+(v, R(v))$  in the region interior to the outgoing shell for an illustrative example  $m(v) = -\beta[1 + \epsilon \cos(\omega v)/v]/v^p$  combining oscillatory and power-law<br>behaviors with  $\beta - 1$ ,  $\omega - 1$ ,  $n - 2$ , and  $\epsilon - 0$  (solid, green, line) or  $\epsilon - 1$  (dashed behaviors, with  $\beta = 1$ ,  $\omega = 1$ ,  $p = 2$ , and  $\epsilon = 0$  (solid green line) or  $\epsilon = 1$  (dashed purple line). Oscillations satisfying the adiabatic conditions adhere, to leading order, to the purely exponential behavior displayed in the solid green line, which is the same as for a stationary regular black hole with the same parameters and perturbation profile. As in the stationary case (see Ref. [[32\]](#page-5-19)), the exponential buildup increases the value of the mass in a short interval of time until a critical time  $v_0 \approx 80$  in which  $M_+(v_0, R(v_0)) \propto v_0^{p+1} M_0^2/\ell = \mathcal{O}(10^7).$ 

Fig. [2](#page-4-2) numerical results for a specific perturbation profile combining oscillatory and power-law behaviors.

Conclusions—We have shown that the exponential buildup characteristic of the mass inflation instability is not limited to stationary black hole spacetimes but extends to dynamical spacetimes, as long as the inner horizon is nonextremal and the geometry is evolving sufficiently slowly as encapsulated in two adiabatic conditions which become exact in the stationary limit, so allowing us to recover the standard results for Cauchy horizons.

Even if one or both adiabatic conditions eventually cease to be valid, this generically happens after this noneternal mass inflation has triggered a rapidly evolving phase resulting into the exponential growth of curvature invariants.

The analysis presented herein is restricted to spherical symmetry; nonetheless, the ingredients leading to noneternal mass inflation in our setting are present and known to generically lead to the same phenomenon, also in the presence of rotation (e.g., [\[45](#page-6-2)[,46\]](#page-6-3)). Hence, there is no reason to expect that inner horizons in rotating black holes would behave any differently.

It has been conjectured that mass inflation might lead to a singularity of null nature in the black hole interior without affecting the exterior geometry [\[65\]](#page-6-21) (see also [\[45](#page-6-2)–[48\]](#page-6-5)). Note that the mass inflation instability and its large backreaction would still be present even close to a null singularity and that this conjecture assumes no resolution of the singularity by quantum gravitational effects. The latter could lead to different scenarios [[52](#page-6-9),[66](#page-6-22)], including regular black holes with inner-extremal cores [\[34,](#page-5-11)[35](#page-5-12)], Simpson-Visser cores (also called hidden wormholes) [[67,](#page-6-23)[68\]](#page-6-24), or bouncing cores[\[36,](#page-5-13)[69\]](#page-6-25) that may result into a horizonless ultracompact object of the same family of the initial regular black hole [\[70\]](#page-6-26).

The implications are striking: generic black holes with (nonextremal) inner horizons will always keep evolving in a timescale controlled by  $1/\kappa_{\text{in}}$  and cannot be the end point of a stellar collapse. It is generally believed that astrophysical black holes are well described by a quasistationary Kerr metric, possibly with a regularized Planckian core. Our results challenge this expectation and show that determining the end point of stellar collapse is an inevitable open question.

Acknowledgments—R. C. R. acknowledges financial support through research Grant No. 29405 from VILLUM fonden. F. D. F. acknowledges financial support by Primus Grant No. PRIMUS/23/SCI/005 from Charles University and by Grant No. GAČR 23-07457S of the Czech Science Foundation. M. V. was supported by the Marsden Fund via a grant administered by the Royal Society of New Zealand.

- <span id="page-4-0"></span>[1] Roger Penrose, Structure of space-time, in Battelle Rencontres (Benjamin, New York, 1968), pp. 121–235.
- [2] Richard A. Matzner, Nelson Zamorano, and Vernon D. Sandberg, Instability of the Cauchy horizon of Reissner-Nordstrom black holes, Phys. Rev. D 19[, 2821 \(1979\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.19.2821).
- <span id="page-4-1"></span>[3] S. Chandrasekhar and J. B. Hartle, On Crossing the Cauchy horizon of a Reissner-Nordstrom black-hole, [Proc. R. Soc. A](https://doi.org/10.1098/rspa.1982.0160) 384[, 301 \(1982\)](https://doi.org/10.1098/rspa.1982.0160).
- <span id="page-5-0"></span>[4] Matt Visser, Lorentzian Wormholes: From Einstein to Hawking (American Institute of Physics Press, Woodbury, New York, 1995).
- <span id="page-5-1"></span>[5] Eric Poisson and W. Israel, Inner-horizon instability and mass inflation in black holes, [Phys. Rev. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.63.1663) 63, 1663 [\(1989\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.63.1663)
- [6] Eric Poisson and W. Israel, Internal structure of black holes, Phys. Rev. D 41[, 1796 \(1990\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.41.1796)
- [7] Amos Ori, Inner structure of a charged black hole: An exact mass-inflation solution, [Phys. Rev. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.67.789) 67, 789 (1991).
- <span id="page-5-2"></span>[8] Patrick R. Brady and John D. Smith, Black hole singularities: A numerical approach, [Phys. Rev. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.75.1256) 75, 1256 [\(1995\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.75.1256)
- <span id="page-5-3"></span>[9] Mihalis Dafermos and Jonathan Luk, The interior of dynamical vacuum black holes I: The  $C^0$ -stability of the Kerr Cauchy horizon, [arXiv:1710.01722.](https://arXiv.org/abs/1710.01722)
- <span id="page-5-4"></span>[10] Stefan Hollands, Robert M. Wald, and Jochen Zahn, Quantum instability of the Cauchy horizon in Reissner– Nordström–deSitter spacetime, [Classical Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab8052) 37[, 115009 \(2020\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab8052)
- <span id="page-5-5"></span>[11] James Bardeen, Nonsingular general relativistic collapse, in Abstracts of the GR5 Conference, Tbilisi, Georgia (Pub. House of Tbilisi University, Tbilisi, Georgia, 1968).
- <span id="page-5-20"></span>[12] Sean A. Hayward, Formation and evaporation of regular black holes, Phys. Rev. Lett. 96[, 031103 \(2006\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.96.031103).
- <span id="page-5-18"></span>[13] Valeri P. Frolov, Information loss problem and a "black hole" model with a closed apparent horizon, [J. High Energy](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP05(2014)049) [Phys. 05 \(2014\) 049.](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP05(2014)049)
- [14] Alfio Bonanno and Martin Reuter, Renormalization group improved black hole space-times, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.62.043008) 62, 043008 [\(2000\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.62.043008)
- [15] Leonardo Modesto, Loop quantum black hole, [Classical](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/23/18/006) [Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/23/18/006) 23, 5587 (2006).
- [16] Kevin Falls, Daniel F. Litim, and Aarti Raghuraman, Black holes and asymptotically safe gravity, [Int. J. Mod. Phys. A](https://doi.org/10.1142/S0217751X12500194) 27[, 1250019 \(2012\).](https://doi.org/10.1142/S0217751X12500194)
- [17] Abhay Ashtekar, Javier Olmedo, and Parampreet Singh, Quantum transfiguration of Kruskal black holes, [Phys. Rev.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.121.241301) Lett. **121**[, 241301 \(2018\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.121.241301).
- [18] Abhay Ashtekar, Javier Olmedo, and Parampreet Singh, Quantum extension of the Kruskal spacetime, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.98.126003) 98[, 126003 \(2018\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.98.126003)
- [19] Emanuele Alesci, Sina Bahrami, and Daniele Pranzetti, Quantum gravity predictions for black hole interior geometry, Phys. Lett. B 797[, 134908 \(2019\).](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physletb.2019.134908)
- [20] Alessia Platania, Dynamical renormalization of black-hole spacetimes, [Eur. Phys. J. C](https://doi.org/10.1140/epjc/s10052-019-6990-2) 79, 470 (2019).
- [21] Jibril Ben Achour, Suddhasattwa Brahma, and Jean-Philippe Uzan, Bouncing compact objects. Part I. Quantum extension of the Oppenheimer-Snyder collapse, [J. Cosmol.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2020/03/041) [Astropart. Phys. 03 \(2020\) 041.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2020/03/041)
- [22] Jibril Ben Achour and Jean-Philippe Uzan, Bouncing compact objects. II. Effective theory of a pulsating Planck star, Phys. Rev. D 102[, 124041 \(2020\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.102.124041).
- [23] J. Ben Achour, S. Brahma, S. Mukohyama, and J. P. Uzan, Towards consistent black-to-white hole bounces from matter collapse, [J. Cosmol. Astropart. Phys. 09 \(2020\) 020.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2020/09/020)
- [24] Alfio Bonanno, Daniele Malafarina, and Antonio Panassiti, Dust collapse in asymptotic safety: A path to regular black holes, Phys. Rev. Lett. 132[, 031401 \(2024\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.132.031401).
- <span id="page-5-6"></span>[25] Florencia Benitez, Esteban Mato, and Javier Olmedo, Analysis of improved dynamics of non-rotating charged black holes, Phys. Rev. D 109[, 064011 \(2024\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.109.064011)
- <span id="page-5-7"></span>[26] Astrid Eichhorn and Aaron Held, Black holes in asymptotically safe gravity and beyond, Regular Black Holes: Towards a New Paradigm of Gravitational Collapse (Springer Nature Singapore, Singapore, 2023).
- [27] Alessia Platania, Black holes in asymptotically safe gravity, Handbook of Quantum Gravity (Springer Nature Singapore, Singapore, 2023).
- <span id="page-5-8"></span>[28] Abhay Ashtekar, Javier Olmedo, and Parampreet Singh, Regular black holes from Loop Quantum Gravity, Regular Black Holes: Towards a New Paradigm of Gravitational Collapse (Springer Nature Singapore, Singapore, 2023).
- <span id="page-5-9"></span>[29] Eric G. Brown, Robert B. Mann, and Leonardo Modesto, Mass inflation in the loop black hole, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.84.104041) 84, [104041 \(2011\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.84.104041)
- [30] Valeri P. Frolov and Andrei Zelnikov, Quantum radiation from an evaporating nonsingular black hole, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.95.124028) 95[, 124028 \(2017\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.95.124028)
- <span id="page-5-17"></span>[31] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, Costantino Pacilio, and Matt Visser, On the viability of regular black holes, [J. High Energy Phys. 07](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP07(2018)023) [\(2018\) 023.](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP07(2018)023)
- <span id="page-5-19"></span>[32] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, Costantino Pacilio, and Matt Visser, Inner horizon instability and the unstable cores of regular black holes, [J. High Energy Phys. 05 \(](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP05(2021)132)2021) 132.
- <span id="page-5-10"></span>[33] Alfio Bonanno, Amir-Pouyan Khosravi, and Frank Saueressig, Regular black holes with stable cores, [Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.103.124027) Rev. D 103[, 124027 \(2021\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.103.124027).
- <span id="page-5-11"></span>[34] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, Costantino Pacilio, and Matt Visser, Regular black holes without mass inflation instability, [J. High Energy](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP09(2022)118) [Phys. 09 \(2022\) 118.](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP09(2022)118)
- <span id="page-5-12"></span>[35] Edgardo Franzin, Stefano Liberati, Jacopo Mazza, and Vania Vellucci, Stable rotating regular black holes, [Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.106.104060) Rev. D 106[, 104060 \(2022\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.106.104060).
- <span id="page-5-13"></span>[36] Carlos Barceló, Valentin Boyanov, Raúl Carballo-Rubio, and Luis J. Garay, Classical mass inflation versus semiclassical inner horizon inflation, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.106.124006) 106, 124006 [\(2022\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.106.124006)
- <span id="page-5-16"></span>[37] Francesco Di Filippo, Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Stefano Liberati, Costantino Pacilio, and Matt Visser, On the inner horizon instability of non-singular black holes, [Universe](https://doi.org/10.3390/universe8040204) 8, [204 \(2022\)](https://doi.org/10.3390/universe8040204).
- [38] Alfio Bonanno, Amir-Pouyan Khosravi, and Frank Saueressig, Regular evaporating black holes with stable cores, Phys. Rev. D 107[, 024005 \(2023\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.107.024005)
- <span id="page-5-21"></span>[39] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, Costantino Pacilio, and Matt Visser, Comment on Regular evaporating black holes with stable cores, [Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.108.128501) Rev. D 108[, 128501 \(2023\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.108.128501).
- <span id="page-5-14"></span>[40] Alfio Bonanno, Amir-Pouyan Khosravi, and Frank Saueressig, Reply to "Comment on 'Regular evaporating black holes with stable cores,'", [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.108.128502) 108, 128502 [\(2023\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.108.128502)
- <span id="page-5-15"></span>[41] Hans Stephani, D. Kramer, Malcolm A. H. MacCallum, Cornelius Hoenselaers, and Eduard Herlt, Exact Solutions of Einstein's Field Equations, Cambridge Monographs

on Mathematical Physics (Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, England, 2003).

- <span id="page-6-0"></span>[42] Alfio Bonanno, Mass inflation in a rotating charged black hole, Phys. Rev. D 53[, 7373 \(1996\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.53.7373)
- [43] Andrew J. S. Hamilton and Pedro P. Avelino, The Physics of the relativistic counter-streaming instability that drives mass inflation inside black holes, [Phys. Rep.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.physrep.2010.06.002) 495, 1 (2010).
- <span id="page-6-1"></span>[44] Donald Marolf and Amos Ori, Outgoing gravitational shock-wave at the inner horizon: The late-time limit of black hole interiors, Phys. Rev. D 86[, 124026 \(2012\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.86.124026)
- <span id="page-6-2"></span>[45] Paul M. Chesler, Erik Curiel, and Ramesh Narayan, Numerical evolution of shocks in the interior of Kerr black holes, Phys. Rev. D 99[, 084033 \(2019\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.99.084033).
- <span id="page-6-3"></span>[46] Paul M. Chesler, Singularities in rotating black holes coupled to a massless scalar field, [arXiv:1905.04613](https://arXiv.org/abs/1905.04613).
- <span id="page-6-4"></span>[47] Paul M. Chesler, Ramesh Narayan, and Erik Curiel, Singularities in Reissner–Nordström black holes, [Classical](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab5b69) [Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab5b69) 37, 025009 (2020).
- <span id="page-6-5"></span>[48] Paul M. Chesler, Numerical evolution of the interior geometry of charged black holes, [Gen. Relativ. Gravit.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10714-021-02853-9) 53[, 84 \(2021\).](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10714-021-02853-9)
- <span id="page-6-6"></span>[49] Charles W. Misner and David H. Sharp, Relativistic equations for adiabatic, spherically symmetric gravitational collapse, Phys. Rev. 136[, B571 \(1964\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRev.136.B571)
- <span id="page-6-7"></span>[50] Sean A. Hayward, Gravitational energy in spherical symmetry, Phys. Rev. D 53[, 1938 \(1996\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.53.1938)
- <span id="page-6-8"></span>[51] Gabriel Abreu and Matt Visser, Kodama time: Geometrically preferred foliations of spherically symmetric spacetimes, Phys. Rev. D 82[, 044027 \(2010\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.82.044027).
- <span id="page-6-9"></span>[52] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, and Matt Visser, Geodesically complete black holes, Phys. Rev. D 101[, 084047 \(2020\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.101.084047)
- <span id="page-6-10"></span>[53] Jerzy Matyjasek, Dariusz Tryniecki, and Mariusz Klimek, Regular black holes in an asymptotically de Sitter universe, [Mod. Phys. Lett. A](https://doi.org/10.1142/S0217732308028715) 23, 3377 (2009).
- <span id="page-6-11"></span>[54] Sharmanthie Fernando, Bardeen–de Sitter black holes, [Int.](https://doi.org/10.1142/S0218271817500717) J. Mod. Phys. D 26[, 1750071 \(2017\)](https://doi.org/10.1142/S0218271817500717).
- <span id="page-6-12"></span>[55] Bethan Cropp, Stefano Liberati, and Matt Visser, Surface gravities for non-Killing horizons, [Classical Quantum](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/30/12/125001) Gravity 30[, 125001 \(2013\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/30/12/125001)
- <span id="page-6-13"></span>[56] Carlos Barceló, Stefano Liberati, Sebastiano Sonego, and Matt Visser, Minimal conditions for the existence of a Hawking-like flux, Phys. Rev. D 83[. 041501\(R\) \(2011\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.83.041501)
- <span id="page-6-14"></span>[57] Carlos Barceló, Stefano Liberati, Sebastiano Sonego, and Matt Visser, Hawking-like radiation from evolving black

holes and compact horizonless objects, [J. High Energy](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP02(2011)003) [Phys. 02 \(2011\) 003.](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP02(2011)003)

- <span id="page-6-15"></span>[58] Tevian Dray and Gerard 't Hooft, The effect of spherical shells of matter on the Schwarzschild black hole, [Commun.](https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01215912) Math. Phys. 99[, 613 \(1985\)](https://doi.org/10.1007/BF01215912).
- <span id="page-6-16"></span>[59] C. Barrabes, W. Israel, and E. Poisson, Letter to the editor: Collision of light-like shells and mass inflation in rotating black holes, [Classical Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/7/12/002) 7, L273 [\(1990\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/0264-9381/7/12/002)
- <span id="page-6-17"></span>[60] Amos Ori, Inner structure of a charged black hole: An exact mass-inflation solution, [Phys. Rev. Lett.](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.67.789) 67, 789 [\(1991\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevLett.67.789)
- <span id="page-6-18"></span>[61] C. Barrabes and W. Israel, Thin shells in general relativity and cosmology: The lightlike limit, [Phys. Rev. D](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.43.1129) 43, 1129 [\(1991\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.43.1129)
- <span id="page-6-19"></span>[62] Richard H. Price, Nonspherical perturbations of relativistic gravitational collapse. I. Scalar and gravitational perturbations, Phys. Rev. D 5[, 2419 \(1972\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.5.2419).
- [63] Richard H. Price, Nonspherical perturbations of relativistic gravitational collapse, II. Integer-spin, zero-rest-mass fields, Phys. Rev. D 5[, 2439 \(1972\)](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.5.2439).
- <span id="page-6-20"></span>[64] Richard H. Price and Lior M. Burko, Late time tails from momentarily stationary, compact initial data in Schwarzschild spacetimes, Phys. Rev. D 70[, 084039 \(2004\).](https://doi.org/10.1103/PhysRevD.70.084039)
- <span id="page-6-21"></span>[65] Mihalis Dafermos, Black holes without spacelike singularities, [Commun. Math. Phys.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00220-014-2063-4) 332, 729 (2014).
- <span id="page-6-22"></span>[66] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, and Matt Visser, Opening the Pandora's box at the core of black holes, [Classical Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab8141) 37, 14 [\(2020\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/ab8141)
- <span id="page-6-23"></span>[67] Alex Simpson and Matt Visser, Black-bounce to traversable wormhole, [J. Cosmol. Astropart. Phys. 02](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2019/02/042) [\(2019\) 042.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2019/02/042)
- <span id="page-6-24"></span>[68] Jacopo Mazza, Edgardo Franzin, and Stefano Liberati, A novel family of rotating black hole mimickers, [J. Cosmol.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2021/04/082) [Astropart. Phys. 04 \(2021\) 082.](https://doi.org/10.1088/1475-7516/2021/04/082)
- <span id="page-6-25"></span>[69] Carlos Barceló, Valentin Boyanov, Raúl Carballo-Rubio, and Luis J. Garay, Black hole inner horizon evaporation in semiclassical gravity, [Classical Quantum Gravity](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/abf89c) 38, [125003 \(2021\).](https://doi.org/10.1088/1361-6382/abf89c)
- <span id="page-6-26"></span>[70] Raúl Carballo-Rubio, Francesco Di Filippo, Stefano Liberati, and Matt Visser, A connection between regular black holes and horizonless ultracompact stars, [J. High](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP08(2023)046) [Energy Phys. 08 \(2023\) 046.](https://doi.org/10.1007/JHEP08(2023)046)